

**MINUTES OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE**  
**Wednesday, 25<sup>th</sup> August 2004 at 7.00 pm**

PRESENT: Councillor Cribbin (Chair), Councillor Harrod (Vice-Chair) and Councillors Chavda, Freeson, Kansagra, McGovern, H B Patel (alternate for Steel), Sengupta and Singh.

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors H.M. Patel and Steel.

Councillors Kagan, C. Patel and Shaw attended the meeting.

**1. Declarations of Personal and Prejudicial Interests**

REF & SITE ADDRESS	CLLR.	NATURE OF INTEREST
04/2046, 04/2062 04/2051 – Land R/O St. Andrews Church, High Road NW10.	Freeson	Personal interest (received telephone call from applicant).
04/0250 – 10 Alverstone Road NW2	Freeson	Personal interest (received telephone call from applicant).
04/1396 – St. Josephs Presbytery Wembley	Cribbin	Personal and prejudicial interest (regularly attends the church).

**2. Requests for Site Visits**

REF	SITE ADDRESS	PROPOSER	REASON
04/2046 04/2062 04/2051	Land R/O St. Andrews Church, High Road NW10	Cllr. Harrod	It was not possible to gain access to the site.

**3. Minutes of Previous Meeting**

RESOLVED:-

that the minutes of the meeting held on 21<sup>st</sup> July 2004 be agreed as a true and accurate record.

**4. Planning Applications**

RESOLVED:-

that the Committee's decisions/observations on the following applications for planning permission under the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended), as set out in the decision column below, be adopted. The full description of the proposed development conditions for approval, the reasons for imposing them and the grounds for refusal are contained in the report from the Director of Planning and in the supplementary information circulated at the meeting.

ITEM NO	APPLICATION NO	APPLICATION AND PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT	DECISION
<b>APPLICATION PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED</b>			
0/01	04/0379	Land next to Wembley Stadium Station, South Way, Wembley, HA9  Outline application for the demolition of 326-342 High Road, Nos 1-19 Wembley Hill Road, Network House, 10-12 Neeld Parade, AIB Bank, 14 Neeld Parade and The Red House, 34A Wembley Hill Road, and the erection of a comprehensive mixed-use redevelopment	Approval, subject to conditions (conditions 6, 9, 16, 20, 28, 32 and 39 were amended), additional new conditions 49, 50, 51 and 52 and a Section 106 agreement as amended in conditions 3, 12, 14, 15, 16 and 17.

The **Director of Planning** advised Members that further information had been received to support the Environmental Statement submitted with the application. He informed the Committee that the Secretary of State for Trade & Industry had confirmed the Compulsory Purchase Order made by the London Development Agency following the inquiry subject to the deletion of plots 1-24 in the schedule to the Order. The Mayor of London had also expressed support for the application but identified a number of issues some of which were reflected in the report. In respect of outstanding issues, he recommended some amendments to the heads of terms of the Section 106 agreement, existing conditions and added new conditions as set out in the supplementary information tabled at the meeting.

In responding to Members' queries, the Director stated that conditions were in place to address contaminants in the area, notably Japanese knotweed. He drew particular attention to amended condition 3 on financial contribution towards the provision of additional education facilities required as a result of the new residential units and confirmed that provision would be made in the section 106 agreement to consider land as well as contributions for education provision.

Members voted on the application which was declared carried.

<b>FOR:</b>	Cllrs Cribbin, Harrod, Chavda, Freeson, McGovern, Sengupta.	<b>(6)</b>
<b>AGAINST:</b>	None	<b>(0)</b>
<b>ABSTENTIONS:</b>	Cllr. Kansagra and H. B. Patel	<b>(2)</b>

## NORTHERN AREA

1/01	04/1204	Vacant Land rear of 15-31 Sonia Gardens, NW10	Approval, subject to conditions
------	---------	---	---------------------------------

Erection of 2 x 3-bedroom detached dwellinghouses

In introducing the report, the **Northern Area Planning Manager** said that the single width access of 3 metres serving the proposed 2 dwellings was acceptable and complied with the Council's SPG. He added that details of levels, lighting and refuse collection were covered by conditions in the report. He then referred to concerns raised by occupiers of properties in Lennox Gardens and Sonia Gardens and the officers' responses as set out in the supplementary information tabled at the meeting. He reiterated the recommendation for approval.

**Mrs. S. Bossick** in objecting to the application said that the unsatisfactory feature of the development would cause harm to the residential amenity. In addition, the access road did not comply with the Council's own SPG. She urged Members to be minded to refuse the application for the above reasons.

**Mr. Porteous** speaking in similar vein said that the proposal constituted an over-development of the site that would generate additional noise nuisance, heavy traffic and lead to loss of light, loss of privacy and would be harmful to the quiet enjoyment of residents' garden amenity. He also urged a refusal of the application.

**Mr John Feeney** the applicant said that the proposal would improve the character of the local area. He endorsed officers' recommendation for approval subject to conditions.

In the ensuing debate, Councillors Kansagra and H Patel expressed a view to be minded to refuse the application due to its impact on the appearance of the area.

The **Planning Manager** responded that two separate Planning Inspectors had accepted the principle of the development on the site adding that the design had been vastly improved with acceptable density levels and a reduced impact on visual amenity.

Members voted on the application for approval which was declared carried.

<b>FOR:</b>	Cllrs Cribbin, Harrod, Freeson, McGovern, Sengupta.	<b>(5)</b>
-------------	---	------------

<b>AGAINST:</b>	None	<b>(0)</b>
-----------------	------	------------

<b>ABSTENTIONS:</b>	Cllr. Chavda, Kansagra and H. B. Patel	<b>(3)</b>
---------------------	--	------------

1/03	04/1656	2 Alverstone Road, Wembley, HA9 9SB	Approval, subject to conditions
------	---------	-------------------------------------	---------------------------------

Erection of part two-storey and part single-storey rear extension to dwellinghouse and conversion of garage into habitable room

1/03	04/1542	41 Kenton Road, Harrow, HA3 0AD	Approved, subject to a s106 agreement and conditions with the deletion of condition No. 8
		Demolition of existing house and erection of 7 apartments with parking	

The **Northern Area Planning Manager** updated Members following discussions with the applicant. Revised plans had been received that resolved the access detail and turning space. He reiterated the recommendation for approval subject to the deletion of condition No. 8 on vehicular access as in the supplementary tabled at the meeting.

**Mr Winston** an objector's agent said that the proposal would lead to construction noise, loss of light and loss of privacy. He requested that an additional condition be imposed for solid wall fencing in the interest of privacy.

In response, the Planning Manager referred to condition 10 that covered the issue of fencing which could be amended to require consultation on the nature of the fencing. He added that construction noise was not normally a planning issue.

Members voted unanimously to approve the application subject to conditions as set out in the main report and deletion of condition 8.

1/04	03/2560	Tennis Courts next to Synagogue, Preston Road, Harrow, HA3	Approved
		Details pursuant to condition 3 (materials) of full planning permission reference 02/1167 dated 17/01/03 for erection of a two-storey synagogue building including associated car parking, landscaping and removal/lopping of trees	

The Planning Manager informed the Committee that the applicant had advised him due to difficulties with levels of drainage at the rear of the new building, the finished ground levels and planting needed to be re-designed. In order to give sufficient time for re-consideration, details of ground levels had been withdrawn from this application

## SOUTHERN AREA

2/01	04/1826	12A-C Mapesbury Road, NW2	Approved, subject to conditions and a Section 106 agreement
		Conversion of existing building into flats, erection of a 3-storey side extension and a rear link to a proposed additional 3-storey building to provide 3 x 1-bedroom, 4 x 2-bedroom and 4 x 3-bedroom flats (7 of the 11 flats being in the existing building) and provision of 7 parking spaces and 3 garages)	

2/02	04/2041	75A Christchurch Avenue, NW6 7NX	Approved, subject to conditions
		Change of use of garages at ground level to one self-contained two-bedroom flat with car parking for three vehicles to the front of 75A Christchurch Avenue	

The **Southern Area Planning Manager** referred to additional objections set out in the supplementary report tabled at the meeting, on grounds of loss of the garages, the insertion of windows without planning consent, loss of amenity space and railings. He added that these issues had been covered in the report and reiterated the recommendation for approval.

**Mrs. Mogadam** raised objections on the grounds of its negative impact on the area and increased parking problems as a result of the loss of the garages.

**Mr. Clyne** also objected on grounds of parking, congestion, reduced green space and outlook. He added that residents had not been fully consulted.

In accordance with the provisions of the Code of Practice, **Councillor Shaw** notified the Committee that she had been approached by the objectors to the application. She added to the objections on the grounds of detrimental impact on the quality of life for the residents and inadequate consultation with residents. She urged a refusal or deferral of the application for a site visit.

**Mr. Vekaria**, the applicant's agent said that the proposal would retain green space and adequate lighting. He added that the traffic problems referred to by the objectors emanated from the local schools.

During debate, **Councillor Chavda** moved an amendment for a site visit which was voted upon and declared lost. Members then voted on the recommendation for approval which was declared carried, with Councillor Chavda abstaining.

2/03	04/2046	Land rear of St Andrew's Church, High Road, NW10	Deferred for a site visit as it was not possible to gain access to the site at the last visit
		Demolition of scout hut building and outbuilding adjacent to St Andrew's Church and partial demolition of hall and erection of new church hall, new access roads off St Andrew's Road and High Road and the erection of 17 dwellinghouses for affordable housing.	
2/04	04/2062	Land rear of St Andrew's Church, High Road, NW10	Deferred for a site visit as it was not possible to gain access to the site at the last visit

		Conservation Area Consent for demolition of scout hut building and outbuilding adjacent to St Andrew's Church and partial demolition of hall, new access road off St Andrew's Road and High Road and the erection of 17 dwellinghouses for affordable housing.	
2/05	04/2051	Land rear of St Andrew's Church, High Road, NW10  Listed Building Consent for demolition of scout hut building and outbuilding adjacent to St Andrew's Church and partial demolition of hall, new access road off St Andrew's Road and High Road and the erection of 17 dwellinghouses for affordable housing.	Deferred for a site visit as it was not possible to gain access to the site at the last visit
2/06	04/1686	76 Donnington Road, NW10 3QU  Erection of a side dormer window and two front roof lights along with the conversion of the property into four self-contained flats	Approved, subject to conditions
2/07	04/0250	10 Alverstone Road, NW2 5JT  Erection of first floor side extension to dwellinghouse	Approved, subject to conditions

The **Southern Area Planning Manager** referred to the supplementary report tabled at the meeting that detailed additional objections adding that most of them had been covered in the main report. In his view, terracing would not result due to the significant set back of the front elevation. In reiterating the recommendation for approval, he said that the design and scale of the development complied with the Council's guidance in SPG5.

**Mrs. Betty Davies** objected on grounds of loss of light and inadequate consultation with the residents. She added that there were no differences between this and the previous application that was refused. In replying to a Member's question she said that her property was approximately 7.5metres from the proposed site.

In accordance with the provisions of the Code of Practice, **Councillor Shaw** said that she had been approached by the objectors to the application. She objected on the grounds of potential terracing effect, loss of light and excessive height of the wall. She urged a refusal or deferral of the application for a site visit.

During debate, **Councillor Chavda** moved an amendment for a site visit which was declared lost. A further amendment by **Councillor Kansagra** to add a further condition requiring the applicant to smooth render the flank wall and paint it white was also put to the vote and declared lost by a majority.

Members voted on the substantive recommendation which was declared carried by a majority.

<b>FOR:</b>	Cllrs Cribbin, Harrod, Freeson, McGovern, Sengupta and Singh	<b>(6)</b>
<b>AGAINST:</b>	Chavda	<b>(1)</b>
<b>ABSTENTIONS:</b>	Cllr. Kansagra and H. B. Patel	<b>(2)</b>

2/08	04/1269	Land next to 864 Harrow Road, NW10	Refused
		Erection of a four-storey building (including 3 basement flats) comprising 6 two-bed flats and 6 one-bed flats with associated amenity space	
2/09	04/1648	79 Leghorn Road, NW10 4PE	Approved, subject to conditions and a Section 106 agreement
		Demolition of an existing workshop and construction of a part 2-storey and part 3-storey block of 11 flats with associated amenity space and boundary enclosure	

### NORTHERN AREA

3/01	04/0401	Park Royal Brewery Farm Land rear of Bodiam, Twyford Abbey Road, NW10 7DR	Approval, subject to conditions (condition 17 was amended), additional new conditions 31 and 32 and a Section 106 agreement
		Demolition of Guinness Sports and Social Club building and 2 squash courts and redevelopment of land to West of Abbeyfields Close and to rear (South) of Abbeyfields Close and Moyne Place to provide a total of 192 residential units (80 affordable) and community centre, doctors' surgery and childcare facility.	

The **West Area Planning Manager** reported that he had been informed that the London Borough of Ealing had raised some concerns but that he had not formally received these. He referred to additional comments on the revised plans, officers' responses to those and queries raised by Members at the site visit as set out in the supplementary report tabled at the meeting. He highlighted the following salient points

- a) the community facility would have a lift and a separate means of access
- b) the Health Authority and the PCT were satisfied with surgery being sited beneath the community facility
- c) the impact on the existing surrounding properties would not be over-dominant and would not lead to loss of lighting and privacy
- d) overshadowing that may occur would not be significant or a serious problem
- e) the Registered Social Landlord was satisfied with the mix of accommodation
- f) the S106 contribution towards education was on the basis of the situation in Brent and officers would pursue the issue with the Borough of Ealing

In reiterating the recommendation for approval, he amended condition 17 on access for construction traffic and added additional conditions 31 (soundproofing) and 32 (car parking spaces).

**Mr. G. M. Paul** objected to the proposed development on the grounds of loss of light, loss of privacy, poor design quality, inadequate parking spaces, increase in crime and decline in social cohesion. Mr. Paul also referred to 4 grounds of objection that Ealing Council had raised to the proposal the previous day.

**Mr. James Ableson** in objection stated that the S106 contribution was unsatisfactory for a development which he considered unsympathetic. On behalf of the Residents' Association, he supported the development as submitted at the outline stage and urged Members to refuse the current revised application.

**Mr. Michael Crook** the applicants' agent stated that the revised scheme complied with SPG17 and resulted from policy changes and that the scheme had been reduced following consultation and negotiations. The mix of affordable and private dwellings was acceptable and there would be no conflict between the community facility and the surgery. Issues about parking would be addressed by the new transport link and a contribution of £75,000. He therefore urged members to approve the application.

The **Director of Planning**, having been handed the Ealing objection by the residents during the meeting, confirmed that it appeared to be a formal objection but reiterated that it had not been received by the Council. The Director of Planning also commented on education contributions and the scale and character of the scheme, following a question by Councillor Freeson and reiterated officer support for the proposal

<b>FOR:</b>	Cllrs Cribbin, Harrod, Freeson, McGovern, Sengupta and Chavda	<b>(6)</b>
<b>AGAINST:</b>	None	<b>(0)</b>
<b>ABSTENTIONS:</b>	Cllr. Kansagra and H. B. Patel	<b>(2)</b>



3/02	04/0891	9 Elmside Road, Wembley, HA9 8JB	Approval, subject to conditions
		Erection of single storey side and rear extension to dwellinghouse	

**Mrs. Hobbs** objected to the proposed development on the grounds that it would lead to additional parking problems. She added that the present occupiers were in the habit of leaving rubbish on the site and that the property would be over-populated.

The objector was advised that most of the issues she had raised were for either the Environmental Health officers or the Council Enforcement Team to investigate.

Members voted unanimously to approve the application as recommended.

3/03	04/1697	85 Clarendon Gardens, Wembley, HA9 7LD	Approved, subject to conditions
		Erection of single storey side and rear extension to dwellinghouse	

In introducing the application, the **West Area Planning Manager** referred to objections raised by the occupants of the neighbouring property and his responses as set out in the supplementary report tabled at the meeting. He reiterated the recommendation for approval.

**Mrs. Ziman-Bright** objected on grounds of loss of light, outlook, privacy and inadequate day lighting. She urged members to either defer for further negotiations or refuse the application.

**Miss Nooh**, the applicant said that amendments had been made to the scheme to comply fully with the Council's guidelines and policies. She urged approval.

Members voted by a majority to approve the application.

<b>FOR:</b>	Cllrs Cribbin, Harrod, Freeson, Kansagra, McGovern, Sengupta and Chavda	<b>(7)</b>
-------------	---	------------

<b>AGAINST:</b>	None	<b>(0)</b>
-----------------	------	------------

<b>ABSTENTIONS:</b>	Cllr. H. B. Patel	<b>(1)</b>
---------------------	-------------------	------------

3/04	04/1727	42 Alric Avenue, NW10	Refused
		Demolition of existing building and erection of 3-storey building to provide 19 self-contained flats (5 two-bedroom, 9 three-bedroom and 5 four-bedroom) and 12 car parking spaces	

The **West Area Planning Manager** reported that he had received a further objection from the occupants of a wholesale/importer company to the rear of the site. The concerns raised were about the amount and location of on-street parking for the residential units, access problems, inadequate amenity space that could give rise to significant safety issues. His recommendation remained refusal.

3/05	03/2782	Guinness Site Phoenix 2, Cumberland Avenue, NW10	Approved, subject to conditions
		Details of Central Line Underground station and platforms, associated cycle and footpath links, landscaping, access road and associated works in pursuance of conditions 2 and 4 of planning permission reference 98/0016 dated 15/07/99	
3/06	04/1854	9 Queenscourt, Wembley, HA9 7QX	Approval, subject to conditions
		Completion of part single storey and two-storey side extension and installation of one front and one side roof light, erection of first-floor rear extension, installation of front roof light and removal of first floor side elevation window to dwellinghouse	
3/07	04/1396	St Joseph's Presbytery, 339 High Road, Wembley, HA9 6AG	Approval, subject to conditions
		Erection of a new pastoral centre	

The Chair left the meeting during consideration of this application, having declared an interest. Councillor Harrod, Vice-Chair, chaired the meeting for this item only. Following a brief discussion, members voted unanimously to approve the application.

## 5. Information Bulletin

Members were requested to note the information reports in the information bulletin circulated prior to the date of the meeting.

RESOLVED:-

that the following be noted:-

- (i) Planning appeals received – 1st – 31st July 2004
- (ii) Enforcement appeals received – 1st – 31st July 2004

- (iii) Planning appeal decisions – 1st – 31st July 2004
- (iv) Enforcement appeal decisions – 1st – 31st July 2004
- (v) Enforcement Selected appeal decisions – 1st – 31st July 2004

## 6. **Any Other Urgent Business**

### ***Best Value Report***

Councillor Freeson referred to the Audit Commission's Best Value report that concluded that the Council had a "good" 2 star service that has 'excellent' prospects for improvement based on evidence obtained during the inspection of the Planning Service. The Commission's conclusions were based on the following;

- i) the service can be easily accessed
- ii) use of s106 funds to support the Council's regeneration agenda
- iii) the service delivers on a series of challenging objectives
- iv) met Government performance targets of 2003/04
- v) its partners and stakeholders spoke highly of the service on major projects
- vi) reality checks by the Inspectors confirmed a responsive planning service.

Members congratulated officers on this achievement.

## 6. **Date of Next Meeting**

The next scheduled meeting of the Committee to consider planning applications only will take place on **Thursday, 23<sup>rd</sup> September 2004** at 7.00 pm. The site visit will take place on the preceding Saturday, 18<sup>th</sup> September 2004 at 9.30 am.

The meeting ended at 10.05 pm.

M CRIBBIN  
Chair

Note: Councillor Singh left meeting at 7.45 pm as he was not feeling well

Mins2003'04/Council/planning/pln25ajj